

# City of Saginaw

---

*Cooperation, Collaboration, & Consolidation of Services Plan  
January 2014*



*Category II – State of Michigan – Economic Vitality Incentive Program*

---



# CITY OF SAGINAW, MICHIGAN COOPERATION, COLLABORATION, AND CONSOLIDATION OF SERVICES PLAN

## **I. Introduction & Background**

The City of Saginaw has a long history of collaborating with its neighboring communities, particularly to provide superior levels of service in areas such as Geographic Information Systems (GIS), Water Treatment and Supply, and Wastewater Treatment. In some cases providing services would not be possible for many local units without these collaborative efforts – such as MBS airport, and in some cases collaboration simply provides a higher level of service to the citizens of Saginaw and the communities with which the city collaborates. Many of these ventures have become routine business for cities, townships, and counties that participate. However, not all collaborative efforts result in significant savings for each

community, but all efforts should strive to provide the best service possible for all involved.

The State of Michigan is currently in the third year of the Economic Vitality Incentive Program (EVIP). This program was developed as a replacement to the Statutory Revenue Sharing Program to foster innovation and collaboration in local government, and provide focus to reduce costs. As part of the EVIP, which strives to improve cooperation between state and local units of government, the city's management team has developed this report to our residents, businesses, and other key stakeholders of the city. The document is comprised of three sections: an update on the status of the proposals that were in the previous year's consolidation plan, new proposals to increase the existing level of cooperation, collaboration, and

consolidation, and a summary of several past collaborative efforts. The first summary lists two initiatives from last year's plan: inspection/code enforcement consolidation with public safety and local unit prosecutor. The second summary of the report describes areas where future efforts, which will potentially be implemented in the upcoming months, are being planned. The third summary is designed to provide a snapshot of the city's existing relationships with other local units. Each component is presented and organized in a manner that is easy to navigate and understand.

In preparing this report, it is our goal to provide citizens, businesses, and other key stakeholders with an understanding of the long term organizational planning and development efforts that are constantly reviewed and managed by city administration and elected officials. It should be noted that all of these initiatives are reviewed with the city's strategic goals and objectives in mind: Crime and Public Safety Issues; Neighborhood Revitalization and City Beatification; Recreational Offering and Youth Activities; Maintenance and Enhancement of City Revenue Efforts; and Organizational Development.

### **Financial Outlook**

The City of Saginaw has a balanced budget for Fiscal Year 2014. However, because the city had to implement an organization restructure for 2014, the city continues to work on

initiatives to reduce expenditures and realize new revenue sources. These initiatives for collaboration and cooperation are essential to that goal. City audits illustrate the structural deficit that has developed over the past three years – in fiscal year 2011 and a greater gap between revenue and expenditures in 2012 and 2013. Additionally, the city's unassigned fund balance is at a critically low level, which requires city administration to monitor all expenditure activities to eliminate all use of unassigned reserves as well as diligently seek new revenue opportunities.

### **Proposals to Increase Cooperative & Collaborative Efforts**

The City of Saginaw already has numerous collaborative and cooperative efforts; however the management team understands that the future of public service is dependent upon finding new and more efficient methods to provide services. The management team and city staff are dedicated to finding new and more effective ways to deliver services to the citizens, businesses, and key stakeholders of Saginaw. The City Manager has established a Management Review Team that meets weekly to review operations and implement recommendations from management as well as other stakeholders. Additionally, other city divisions and committees, such as the Police and Fire Pension Board continue to review cost saving and collaborative measures. City administration continues to discuss cost savings measures

with its collective bargaining units – AFSCME, POAM, COAM, IAFF and SEIU.

**2014 New Initiatives:**

*Blight Elimination Efforts*

The City of Saginaw continues to partner with Saginaw County and the Saginaw County Lank Bank with the 2013 TARP Blight Elimination Grant. Through this collaborative effort over \$11 million will be utilized to assist this community through the demolition of blighted structures, which will allow for stabilization of neighborhoods and the surrounding community. This initiative will encourage economic redevelopment in the region.

*Shared Geographical Information Services with Local Units of Government*

The City of Saginaw also continues to form new alliances with other local governments outside of Saginaw County as well as organizations in the private sector. This proposal reflects a new initiative with the City of Owosso, in neighboring Shiawassee County, to provide for its GIS services, making them the newest potential member of the Saginaw Area GIS Authority (SAGA).

*Consumers Energy for Tree Trimming, Removal, and Replacement*

Since April of 2013, the City of Saginaw and Consumers Energy have been working together to maintain the aesthetic appeal of many of Saginaw’s tree-lined city streets, while ensuring the safe and reliable delivery of electricity to city residents by trimming, removing, or replacing trees and tree limbs that interfere with overhead power lines.

*Inspections/Code Enforcement Efforts II:*

In 2014, the City of Saginaw continues to review all processes to gain efficiencies and effectiveness of its service delivery systems. One area that has continued to evolve is Inspections/Code Enforcement. The city has developed a systematic approach toward increasing public health and safety through the combined efforts of Community Public Safety – Police and Fire, Neighborhood Services (Inspections and Code Enforcement), Public Services, and Environmental Improvement. Through the coordination of this internal collaboration, resources are allocated to designated areas in a more effective approach that will address the needs and concerns of the residents, business, and other key stakeholders of the community.

## **Current Collaborative, Cooperative, & Consolidation Efforts**

The City has a long history of working with other units of local government and community groups to provide services. These types of collaborative efforts can be seen in numerous projects: from the countywide GIS system to the rejuvenation of Hoyt Park, which was a project initiated by the great citizens of the City of Saginaw. City staff and administration are dedicated to working with any group that has sound ideas that will benefit the public. A summary of current collaborative projects is included in this report.

**Economic Vitality Incentive Program  
Consolidation Plan (Previous Filer)  
as of: January 31, 2014**

**II. Update Status of Previous Year's Service Consolidation Proposal(s)  
(This Plan Available to the Public Via the Internet/City Website)**

Local Unit Name: City of Saginaw  
County: Saginaw County

Previous Year's Service Consolidation Proposals	Timeline to Accomplish Proposal	Jurisdictions Involved	Realized or Estimated Savings/(Loss)	Implementation Status of Proposal	Barriers Experienced in Implementing Proposal
1. Fire Collaboration and Consolidation Project	January 2012 - January 2015	Originally City of Saginaw, Bridgeport Township, and Buena Vista Township	Estimated \$100,000 - \$355,000 upon completion; to date, no savings have been realized	Not feasible at this time	Political issues regarding deployment of equipment and will to proceed
2. Public Services - Equipment Upgrade (Automated Meter Reading Infrastructure System)	April 2013 - October 2017	City of Saginaw	Estimated \$324,000/Year upon completion; to date, \$30,000	In progress (the first phase has been completed) It is currently in phase two	Equipment limitations and geography
3. Inspections/Code Enforcement Consolidation with Public Safety	Jan 2013 - June 2013	City of Saginaw	Approximately \$107,000	Completed	At this point, insurmountable barriers are not anticipated. However possible barriers include collective bargaining issues and training of employees
4. Local Unit Prosecutor	March 2013 - April 2013	City of Saginaw & Saginaw County & Private Contractor	Cost Neutral	Arrangement has been altered	This proposal has been altered due to the election of a new County Prosecutor

**Additional Information:**

**Consolidation #1:**

The Fire Collaboration and Consolidation project has not proceeded as planned. The city and two townships were awarded an EVIP grant for further analysis, however Buena Vista Township did not want to continue with the project at that point. The city is still in discussions with Bridgeport Township and the hope is that some job sharing and collaboration will occur. At this point it appears that the best initial option will likely be to proceed with some sort of shared command, which would reduce expenditures for each unit, and move forward with further planning once that is implemented. Estimated savings was based on full implementation of the initial proposal. A scaled back plan will result in less savings for all local units involved.

**Consolidation #2:**

The Public Services Department has already started this ambitious city-wide project and should complete it within the proposed timeline. The savings will be generated from a reduced number of employees for meter reading (employees may be reallocated to other functions) and equipment cost. This update will also provide better service to customers of the water department as the city will be able to detect abnormalities in use that may be due to damage at their home or defects in the system. There have been some issues with the signal received from the meters due to trees, etc. but it is anticipated that those issues will be resolved. Estimated savings of approximately \$30,000 have been realized in the first year. The timeline has shifted due to weather and geographical issues.

**Consolidation #3:**

In early 2013 the City of Saginaw consolidated its Inspections and Code Enforcement Services under the umbrella of Public Safety. Combined with Public Safety, the Community Public Safety -Inspections and Neighborhood Services proved a more coordinated enforcement structure, which in turn provided improved services to the citizens, businesses, and key stakeholders of the community. In late August, the Assistant City Manager for Public Safety position became vacant. In order not to lose the continuity of these services, Community Public Safety -Inspections and Neighborhood Services began reporting to the City Manager. Today, these services continue the effort that was first established under the Assistant City Manager for Public Safety.

**Consolidation #4:**

The City of Saginaw has decided to contract with an independent contractor to provide local prosecuting services instead of the County Prosecutor at this time. The independent contractor and the city continues to work collaboratively with the County Prosecutor's office on municipal violations and city income tax enforcement efforts. Going forward, there still is a possibility that the City will contract with the County Prosecutor in subsequent years.

**Economic Vitality Incentive Program  
Consolidation Plan (Previous Filer)  
as of: January 31, 2014**

**III. Proposed Service Consolidation(s)  
(This Plan Available to the Public Via the Internet/City Website)**

Local Unit Name: City of Saginaw  
County: Saginaw County

Service Consolidation Proposal	Timeline to Accomplish Proposal	Jurisdictions Involved	Realized or Estimated Savings/(Loss)	Implementation Status of Proposal	Barriers Experienced in Implementing Proposal
1. Blight Elimination Efforts with Saginaw County and Saginaw County Land bank	September 2013 - March 2014	City of Saginaw, Saginaw County Land Bank, Saginaw Downtown Development Authority	More than \$11 million in savings	Demolition began in October 2013.	Projected building to be demolished will not be demolished in its entirety, resulting in finding new buildings to demolish and return of unspent grant funds.
2. Geographical Information System (GIS) Services Collaboration with local government entities	To Be Determined	City of Saginaw, City of Owosso	Approximately \$70,000	Under Negotiations	Discussion are ongoing and will require approval of city council for both municipalities
3. Consolidated Effort with Consumer Energy for Tree Trimming, Removal and Potential Replacement	January 2014 - December 2014	City of Saginaw and Consumers Energy	Cost Savings of \$30,000 to \$50,000	Begins April 2013	Consumer Energy's ability to continue the services after the first year.
4. Inspections/Code Enforcement Effort II	March 2014 - June 2014	City of Saginaw	Cost Neutral	This proposal is under review by the City Manager and the Management Review Team	No barriers to this proposal

**Additional Information:**

Consolidation #1:

The Blight Elimination efforts will promote public safety, a stabilized property values, enhanced economic development opportunities, and the stabilization of the environment in the City of Saginaw. This allows the city to increase the properties values, which will lead to an increased interest in the city for residents and business for the long term. It is anticipated that the savings will result in reduced crime and public safety issues, a growth in residential life, as well as financial stability. In addition, this will allow for a smartizing of the city.

Consolidation #2:

A cooperation agreement between the City of Saginaw and the City of Owosso would provide the City of Saginaw the ability to generate new revenues in the field as well as the ability to provide savings to other Michigan cities. Furthermore, the City of Owosso will gain the ability to realize savings in personnel and/or contract services that would otherwise would not be realized for GIS services.

Consolidation #3:

A collaboration with Consumer Energy to work with the City for tree trimming and removal of dead, dying, or diseased trees within the City of Saginaw's right of way. The benefit to the city means a reduction in crew time of 200 hours and the minimization of duplication efforts for tree trimming, and removal of dead, dying, or diseased trees. This equates to an anticipated savings which range between \$30,000 to \$50,000 annually.

Consolidation #4:

This is an internal collaborative effort between Police, Fire, Neighborhood Services (Code Enforcement/Inspections), Public Services, and Environment Improvement to provide more effective services through a systematic approach toward increasing public health and safety throughout the community. The city benefits by providing services directly to an assigned area which addresses the concerns of the neighborhoods. This is a cost neutral.

### III. Existing Relationships/Prior Collaborative Efforts

Service Area & Initiative	Description	Communities / Others Involved	Estimated Savings
<b>Administrative Services</b>			
Geographical Information Systems Authority	The GIS Authority identifies opportunities and develops and promotes initiatives for the application of GIS, as well as the development of the Saginaw area in general.	32 Saginaw County municipalities, Saginaw County 911 Authority, Saginaw County Road Commission	Value Added Service/Generates \$92,713 in revenue per year
Saginaw Future	Acts as consultant to the City through the Department of Community Services; provides services in the areas of promoting and strengthening the jobs and investments of employers who are currently in the City of Saginaw; aggressively attracts and encourages national and international businesses to relocate and invest in the City, which ensures a diversity of components in the economic base; and provides industrial development location opportunities.	County of Saginaw, City of Saginaw, 16 local communities, and the Saginaw County Chamber of Commerce	Value Added Service
Michigan Delivering Extended Agreements Locally (MiDeal)	The Department of Fiscal Services - Purchasing Division participates in the state's plan to allow local units of government to benefit from the state's purchasing power by allowing local units to purchase from state contracts.	State of Michigan and several other local units of government	\$10,000 Annually
Michigan Intergovernmental Trade Network (MITN)	A group of agencies that joined forces to create a Regional Bid Notification System to notify companies of new bid opportunities. Member companies are provided with instant access to all bids, RFPs, quotes, addendums and awards.	Multiple cities, counties, colleges, and schools	\$5,000 Annually
MBS International Airport	The cities of Saginaw and Midland along with Bay County established the Midland, Bay City, and Saginaw International Airport Commission to manage the operations at MBS International Airport.	Cities of Saginaw, Midland, and Bay County	Value Added Service
Technical Services	The Information Services Department and the GIS Department were merged to create the Department of Technical Services.	Internal Consolidation	FY 2011 savings of \$208,300; FY 2012 projected savings of \$235,725, FY 2013 projected savings of \$242,797
Community Public Safety	A combined approach to public safety which integrates police, fire, and code enforcement. All three areas maintain separate operations, with the combining of the administration under the Assistant City Manager for Public Safety.	Internal Collaboration	Value Added Service
Facilities Management	An integrated approach to managing facilities resources citywide. In previous years, outside buildings such as the Police Department managed facility services independently, which resulted in increased costs for facilities management.	Internal Consolidation	Value Added Service/Savings through bulk supply ordering
Celebration Park	A repurposing project that essentially created a new park that includes one of the areas largest splash pads, a skate park, walking trail, playground, and observation deck for Lake Linton. As an addition, a boulder climbing garden and connector park will be added to this system in 2014.	City of Saginaw, State of Michigan, Private Donors	\$1,758,800 in grants and donations
Ordinance Enforcement	All code enforcement activities have been centralized under the Department of Community Services and Public Services to ensure that all activities are monitored in the same manner. These areas are Environmental Improvement, Parking Enforcement, and Weed Abatement	Internal Consolidation	\$35,000 per year
City Controller's Office	The city outsourced the accounting function within the Department of Fiscal Services.	Internal Consolidation	\$100,000 per year
City Attorney's Office	The city eliminated the City Attorney's Office and contracted with a local law firm to provide general legal services.	Internal Consolidation	\$200,000 per year



### III. Existing Relationships/Prior Collaborative Efforts

Service Area & Initiative	Description	Communities / Others Involved	Estimated Savings
<b>Community Services and Inspections and Neighborhood Services</b>			
Regional Construction Code Enforcement	The Inspections Division provides code enforcement/inspections services to other local units in Saginaw County.	City of Saginaw, Saginaw Township, City of Zilwaukee, and Spaulding Township.	\$54,000 per year in revenue
City/County Land Bank Cooperation	The Department of Community Services and the Saginaw County Land Bank are partners in a massive blight elimination and community revitalization program in the City of Saginaw.	Saginaw County Land Bank and the City of Saginaw	Value Added Service and \$800,000 in blight removal
Safe Routes to School	A major initiative to provide Safe Routes to School was conducted through this collaborative effort. Major structural changes are being made in the environment around five schools in Saginaw. This includes sidewalks, lighting and public safety signage. The objective is to provide a safe walk to school environment in these areas.	City of Saginaw, Michigan Department of Transportation, Saginaw Public Schools	Value Added Service
Downtown Planning Initiative/City Master Plan	The partners worked together to provide a Downtown Planning Initiative and develop the Master Plan for the City that will include initiatives on streets and other service areas in adjoining communities. The Master Plan was completed in the summer of 2011 and distributed to all surrounding municipalities for comment. MSHDA has provided continual technical support in various areas of blight elimination and development throughout the area.	City of Saginaw, MSHDA	Value Added Service/\$32,000 in grant funding
Street Resolution Plan	Cooperative effort to complete a street resolution project in conjunction with the development of the master plan.	City of Saginaw, Saginaw Township	Value Added Service
Regional Pathways Project	Collaborative effort to provide regional pathways connecting three trails in the area for quality of life improvement	Cities of Saginaw, Bay City, and Midland	Value Added Service
Regional Training Project	Joint effort to provide commissioner training, inspections, and zoning information	City of Saginaw, Saginaw Township, and Zilwaukee Township	Value Added Service

### III. Existing Relationships/Prior Collaborative Efforts

Service Area & Initiative	Description	Communities / Others Involved	Estimated Savings
<b>Public Services/Water &amp; Waste Water Treatment</b>			
Collective Bargaining Agreement Supplement	The City of Saginaw and the SEIU Salaried and SEIU Hourly Unions entered into agreement in December 2011 to supplement the Collective Bargaining Agreement to allow Hourly Streets and Salaried Traffic Maintenance and Engineering Sections to work across bargaining units in an effort to balance workloads in times of necessity. The agreement allowed the Director of Public Services to eliminate 5.5 Crossover positions and create 3 other positions with existing Crossover positions.	SEIU Salary Bargaining Unit 517M, SEIU Hourly Bargaining Unit 517M, City of Saginaw	\$278,000 Annually
Weed Abatement Project	The city is under contract with the Saginaw County Land Bank to provide weed abatement services to vacant properties to ensure that they are in compliance with city ordinances and guidelines.	City of Saginaw and the Saginaw County Land Bank	\$80,000 Annually
Radio Operations Fund	The Radio Operations Fund supports both maintenance and future replacement of all radio devices and emergency siren system. The estimated replacement cost of the entire Public Service System is \$600,000. The public safety radios were provided by Saginaw County 9-1-1 Authority in 2009 as part of a countywide E911 system improvement. Estimated cost of this system is approximately \$550,000. The Saginaw County 9-1-1 Authority has taken over responsibility for the maintenance and future replacement of all public safety radios.	City of Saginaw and Saginaw County 911 Authority	\$550,000 one time and approximately \$15,000 annually
Maintaining Agency for MDOT Highways in the City	The city provides maintenance services to state roadway signals and signs, as well as street maintenance (snow plowing, filling of pot holes) to state highways throughout the city.	City of Saginaw and the State of Michigan	\$300,000 in revenue annually
Saginaw-Midland Municipal Water Supply Corporation	The City of Saginaw is a co-owner of the corporation with the City of Midland. The corporation supplies water to Saginaw, Midland, Linwood, Standish, Omer, Au Gres, and the Sims-Whitney Water Authority.	Cities of Saginaw and Midland	Value added service
Saginaw Water Supply System	This is a regional water system operated by the city that supplies 17 wholesale customers serving nearly 180,000 customers in Saginaw, Bay, and Tuscola Counties.	17 Wholesale customers in three counties	\$206,278 in PA 425 revenue to the general fund
Saginaw Waste Water Treatment Plant	The waste water treatment plant contracts with Northwest Utilities to treat sewage from the communities of Saginaw Township, City of Zilwaukee, Carrollton Township, and Kochville Township. Also contracts with Spaulding Township to treat waste water.	5 local units in Saginaw County	Provides service to other communities at cost

### III. Existing Relationships/Prior Collaborative Efforts

Service Area & Initiative	Description	Communities / Others Involved	Estimated Savings
<b>Community Public Safety</b>			
County-wide Emergency Services Team	Police EST (commonly known as SWAT) is a collaborative team comprised of 15 officers from 5 agencies; this team is available county-wide and also provides support to local units outside of Saginaw County.	Saginaw, Saginaw Township, Saginaw County, Frankenmuth, Bridgeport Township	Value Added Service
County-Wide Mutual Aid Agreements	The city has mutual aid agreements with other local units for the police department and the fire department.	Several local units in Saginaw County	Value Added Service
County-wide Dispatch Services - 911 Authority	The city participates in county-wide dispatch services for police and fire.	Several local units in Saginaw County	\$1,100,000.00
Prosecutor's County-wide Crime Prevention Council - Member	The city participates in the County Prosecutor's Crime Prevention Council which coordinates multi-agency initiatives, shares intelligence and crime analysis county-wide, and provides advocacy for millage efforts.	Saginaw County, Saginaw, Saginaw Township, Saginaw ISD, and other local units	Value Added Service
Regional Analysis Police Technology Observation and Reporting (RAPTOR)	Technology center created by the city that will provide regional crime analysis/mapping for multiple agencies, video surveillance, partnership with local universities for crime analysis	Saginaw, Michigan State University, other local unit law enforcement agencies	Grant funding of \$300,000
Joint Use of Fire Training Facilities	The Saginaw Township Fire Department (STFD) has constructed a building used for smoke training, interior reconfiguration rescue, and confined space rescue that is a shared facility. The Saginaw City Fire Department is able to use the STFD facility on a no-cost basis eliminating the expense of constructing and operating such a facility. The duplication of fire training facilities cost is eliminated and improves the level of firefighter training. In the last quarter of 2013, discussions were initiated regarding conducting joint training with Saginaw Township Fire Department utilizing abandoned homes scheduled for demolition with the city of Saginaw for training. These structures would be used for forcible entry, search and rescue, and ventilation training. However, these collaborative training session would not include live fire training.	Saginaw Township and the City of Saginaw	\$300,000 one time and ongoing facilities maintenance
Saginaw County Emergency Management	Funding for emergency support and operations equipment has been made available through Saginaw County Emergency Management (SCEM) and has eliminated the necessity for duplicated grant application and administration. The vital equipment made available through SCEM supports emergency disaster response within the City of Saginaw.	Local fire departments in Saginaw County	Value Added Service
Michigan State Police - Emergency Management Homeland Security (MSP-EM)	MSP-EM eliminates duplication of services in time of disaster through support services that are not available at the local level. The Regional Response Team Network (RRTN) eliminates duplication of equipment and expense for specialized hazardous materials equipment through the coordination of MSP-EM.	City of Saginaw, State of Michigan	In excess of \$100,000 for equipment purchases
Fire Department Apparatus Review	Reviewed fire service calls and the necessary apparatus to provide the appropriate response. This resulted in moving trucks from active status to reserve status.	Internal Review/Consolidation	Value Added Services/\$274,000 in equipment maintenance
Bay Area Narcotic Team (BAYANET)	The City of Saginaw Police Department has assigned an officer to Bay Area Narcotics Team (BAYANET), which is a multi agency drug enforcement team.	City of Saginaw, Michigan State Police, and Other Local Units	\$70,000 savings annually
Major Crimes Task Force	The City of Saginaw Police Department is working with Michigan State Police in a joint for "Major Crime Task Force". This unit is responsible for investigating and solving major crime cases such as homicide, shooting, and armed robberies.	City of Saginaw and Michigan State Police	Value Added Services